
**MINUTES OF THE CCB EXECUTIVE MEETING HELD ON THURSDAY 12 OCTOBER 2017
IN THE ULLADULLA CIVIC CENTRE - COMMENCING AT 11.00 AM**

Present:

Russ Pigg – General Manager
Craig Milburn – Director, Finance Corporate and Community Services
Phil Costello – Director, Planning Environment and Development Services
Tony Fraser – Acting Director, Assets and Works
Jessica Rippon – Executive Manager, Communications
Kate Ryan – Community Engagement / CCB Officer
Clr White
Clr Kitchener
Clr Gash
Clr Levett
Clr Wells
Terrie Gardner – Ulladulla & Districts Community Forum
Pat Mitchell - Ulladulla & Districts Community Forum
Tony Lund – Currarong Community Association Inc
Jan Gregory - Ulladulla & Districts Community Forum
James Morris – Callala Bay Community Association
Graeme Cora – Cambewarra Residents and Ratepayers Association
Gail Stebbings – Cambewarra Residents and Ratepayers Association
Garry Kelson – Huskisson/Woollamia Community Voice
Tim Beckett – Bawley Point/Kioloa Community Association
Phil Bradshaw – Milton 2538 CCB
Ros Vickey – Vincentia Ratepayers and Residents Association
Bob Pullinger - Vincentia Ratepayers and Residents Association
Chris Coffey – Ulladulla & Districts Community Forum
Narrell Brown – Basin Villages Forum
Robyn Kerves – Conjola Community Association
Keith Jones – Lake Tabourie Ratepayers and Residents Association
Joan Lonergan – Lake Tabourie Ratepayers and Residents Association
Robyn Ralph – Red Head Villages Association
Kerry Howes – Sussex Inlet and Districts Community Forum
Gail Drummond – Sussex Inlet and Districts Community Forum
Gwen Downie - Sussex Inlet and Districts Community Forum
Robyn Flack – Shoalhaven Heads Community Forum
Rob Bell - Shoalhaven Heads Community Forum
Stuart Coughlan – Berry Forum
David Reynolds – Basin Villages Forum
David Campbell – Hyams Beach Villagers Association
Maree Harris – Mollymook Seascape Motel
Stephen Harris - Mollymook Seascape Motel

1. Welcome

Jessica Rippon welcomed the members of the CCB's, Councillors and staff present and introduced Kate Ryan, Council's Community Engagement / CCB Officer.

Jessica asked the CCB's to advise the room of who they are and where they are from when speaking to the meeting.

2. Shoalhaven Water, REMs and Water Restrictions

Carmel Krogh – Director Shoalhaven Water provided a PowerPoint presentation.

The following points were made during the presentation:

- Water Restrictions may be necessary before summer due to the dry spell. The trigger for Level 1 water restrictions is the point in time when Bamarang Dam's water level drops to 60% of its full capacity.
- Compared 2016 and 2017 inflows to Tallowa dam on a graph that highlighted the 2017 dry spell
- Under the current demand scenario and no rain we would expect Level 1 water restrictions by 15 November
- Clarification of Water transfers to Sydney
 - We are not sending water to Sydney
 - Tallowa Dam is not owned by Council, it is owned by Water NSW (State Government)
 - There are restrictions on any transfers to Sydney under the Metropolitan Water Plan
 - Water cannot be transferred to Sydney unless the total storage in the Sydney water supply system is less than 75% and they can only take the top metre of water from Tallowa Dam (top 3 in a severe drought)
 - Tallowa Dam has 90,000 ML
- Southern Supply and Kangaroo Valley
 - Kangaroo Valley have their own water treatment plant feeding into Kangaroo Valley
 - Porters Creek Dam feeds the Southern area and can also be supplied from Bamarang as well if we need to.
 - Council had the grand opening of Porters Creek Dam on 23 February 2017 which was a very successful project
- REMS1B is a major project upgrade of the Nowra/Bomaderry treatment plant
 - The project is 12 months into the contract and running a few months behind schedule and everyone is working very hard to deliver the project on time.
- Watermain Replacement Program - Burrill Lake - Lake Tabourie
 - Council is undertaking a major replacement of the water main
 - A track is being put over the main, it is not a formal cycleway and has not been designed as such
- Sussex Inlet Watermain Replacement
 - The watermain replacement project on Jacobs Drive and River Road - project is similar to Lake Tabourie (white PVC pipes that have a history of breakages)

-
- Towers
 - There is a new tower at Vincentia
 - There is a new tower at Cambewarra and the old tower has been demolished

Shoalhaven Water received the Training Award for NSW Large Employer of the Year. The other finalists were the Commonwealth Bank and KFC.

Questions:

Q: If there isn't any rain, what is the worst case scenario and how long will restrictions work?

A: The last restrictions were 2012. A lot of people become more aware of water usage when restrictions are in place. People are doing the right thing.

The Shoalhaven have a very secure water supply. People are aware of not wasting water, and we monitor the flows and demands. The Shoalhaven has had a very dry spring, we are trying to predict things on the information available.

Q: What do you mean by level 1 restrictions?

A: No unattended sprinklers, no hosing of hard surfaces, need residents to use common sense, wash with a trigger hose. Further details are on our website.

3. Russ Pigg - Introduction

Russ Pigg welcomed all the people in attendance and advised that the Mayor was an apology. The following points were made:

- The order of business will change from the original agenda.
- Russ introduced Phil Costello, Director Planning, Environment and Development who worked for Council in the late 90's before moving on to Eurobodalla and Kiama Council's.
- We were advised yesterday that Shoalhaven won a Local Environment Excellence in Protection Award for the work completed at Sussex Inlet.
- Next month is National Asbestos Awareness Month, there will be a lot of promotion and awareness in relation to this. Documents will be available online, including home checklists for land owners. Council will be supporting that month.
- There is a Report going up next week, recommending we declare Shoalhaven as a Fossicking District.
- Endeavour energy tree trimming activities, there are a few areas that have raised concerns

4. Introduction of New Group Director – Key Issues – Planning and Development

Phil Costello introduced himself and advised that he hadn't yet had a chance to get around to all the CCB's but would be happy to discuss anything if they needed to contact him. Phil provided a presentation and the following points were made:

- Congratulations to Sussex Inlet for the work they have done.
- Development Applications:

- There is a lack of understanding in the process, a few highlights of the statutory process
- Development Applications is a statutory process across NSW, there is legislation, and 79C assessment, State Government Policies, LEP, they all need to be considered as part of the process and also need to follow Policy and Environmental, Social and Economic Impacts
- DA's need to have site plans and site analysis etc as prescribed
- There are planning Principles – Land and Environment Court e.g Privacy, view sharing, access to sunlight etc. Failure to address any of these can lead to third party LEC appeal
- Some of the other issues and or considerations are: Flora and fauna, coastal hazards, bushfires, flooding and environmental/riparian, it is a complex process
- Notification requirements for various levels of development and DA documentation is available on the website.
- DA activity slide – applications are tracking fairly high and are in the top 10 in the state for DA's received

Q: Are you aware of past Section 96 applications?

A: Some may be notified depending on determined impact, it could be a simple change in roof pitch, in which case notification would not occur

Q: The CCB is not aware of some publications?

A: Under normal circumstances and Council's Consultation Policy, a Section 96 with a significant variation or impact would notify to the CCB's.

Q: In Manyana there are 3 large scale developments in the area, how can a DA be bypassed Council to State Government? The DA's have been sitting around for 10 years, and one is brining 40 sites and then 280 sites and then 300 sites. If assessments are done 10 years ago, does there have to be a new report done if the environment and new species are found?

A: It is a complex process, the State Government was the consent authority, under the Environmental Protection Act. There was a consultation process approval granted and, they are entitled to act on that approval. Conditions remain valid.

Q: Clr Levett – what is the difference in notification requirements from DA to Section 96 to local residents?

A: Layers of development has different notification requirements, Section 96 is the same as new development if there is going to be an impact or potential impact for those people that were previously notified

Q: Ulladulla – It can be difficult for CCB's to be aware of change of developments, for example the large scale development in Narrawallee we were only made aware on the day that the comments were closing. Q: Can the officers keep an eye out to alert the CCB of large scale developments?

A: Emails are sent to CCB's weekly with new applications also details are on our website.

A: Russ Pigg - the DA tracking online is very helpful and has a lot of search functions, it can search for Section 96 applications and by date and you can always ask Council to extend the time period for submissions.

5. Communication and Community Engagement Survey

Jessica Rippon – Executive Strategy Manager provided the following information:

- Council is running a Community Engagement Survey on the Internet and Facebook. Focus is building on the Strategy going forward, how do people want information and how to reach the residents. The survey will run at the end of October. Things to consider are; what methods you like to communicate e.g radio, e-news, newspapers etc, also looking at benchmark for how you feel now on current communications.
- Will receive the results, IRIS does a satisfaction survey and we will combine the 2 surveys together.
- Will involve those interested in a community group

Q: CCBs were down the bottom of the survey, and the age bracket ended at 56

A: The survey is also trying to tap into other demographics that we don't normally reach.

Adjourn for Lunch – time – 12.45pm

Reconvene – time – 1.20pm

6. Special Rate Variation

Craig Milburn – Director Finance, Corporate and Community Services thanked the CCBs in attendance and provided a presentation and the following points were made:

- An Extra Ordinary meeting is scheduled for the DPOP and in relation to rate rises.
- Where we are at:
 - IPART decision - determined for this year only to increase by 13.2% including the rate peg and then it is to be removed.
 - IPART comments, they are aware that there is a need for and the extent of the rise
- Need for a pathway
 - Council needs to be financially sustainable
 - There is no strategy beyond this year if we don't do something or our assets will deteriorate
- Current position
 - Assets need significant maintenance and renewals
 - Council has ongoing deficits and our rates aren't meeting the expenditure
- Assets:
 - Concerns were raised last year over how council manages its assets
 - Council has a rolling cycle of assets valuation every 5 years
 - A review all of Works in Progress and the quality of renewable assets, how council treats crown lands, and lands under roads etc will be presented to the Audit Office
 - Fit for the future targets displayed on screen, without significant change, the back log of maintenance will keep increasing.
- Capital Works - Spend compared to other Councils:
 - We get benchmarked against other Councils (per capita spend), we are classed as a regional Council. We are spending a lot more on assets but unable to keep up with the maintenance
- Community:
 - Satisfaction levels and surveys - survey results show that the communities priorities are with: roads, unsealed roads, footpaths, the DA process, public toilets etc, we do not have the resourcing to keep up
- Increasing Community Expectations:

-
- Council has received a significant increase in calls through the 111 number, this doesn't include calls direct to staff
 - Number of records are increasing
 - CRM (customer request) continuing to rise
 - GIPPA requests are increasing along with the complexity of the request
 - Property searches are increasing
 - Official complaints have jumped
 - Resourcing levels:
 - Council is facing a number of resourcing issues
 - Growing Local economy – Development Applications – DA's and CDC's received are increasing and the resourcing demands are huge
 - 156 DA's per staff member notes a significant resourcing issue compared with Wollongong 70 per staff member
 - Compare staff costs to operating capacity to other councils, we are under the benchmark (31% to 33%) which equates to \$8M, just looking at corporate services – overall 4.6 staff to every \$10m of expenditure, 18 staff short of where we should be
 - 131 staff in relation to the population, a low level of resourcing, we are efficient though
 - Options:
 - Do nothing, Live within means, keep 13.2% plus add 5+5+5,
 - If we do nothing – operating result improves, renewals are going backwards, cant keep business as usual
 - Live within means: results in, cut services – see hand out, increases in fees, no new capex,
 - Staff recommend – go to IPART to keep the current 13%, plus next 3 years 5% increases, maintenance of renewal ratio will go up, improvement on current situation,
 - How and why is it different: - we have listened to the community and Councillors etc, have reduced the total amount of the increase. Have spread the 15% over 3 years,
 - What it means for ratepayer - \$298 increase over the 4 years
 - What will money be spent on: - over \$1m extra into maintenance, won't get the level of deterioration, will be in a reasonable condition for future generations
 - SRV expenditure: funding current operations, additional maintenance, staff shortages, renewal of capital
 - Special rates fund: \$600,000 on roads, \$200,000 building maintenance, \$200,000 on parks maintenance,
 - Fit For The Future ratios – general fund: positive position by 2021, maintenance ratio will get up to 99.9%
 - How do we compare to other councils: we are 18% lower than Coffs on annual rates compared to income, affordability to pay, other councils are paying more

Q: Analysis on land valuations?

A: All Councils had their land valued, impacts in areas and properties vary but doesn't impact what money Council collects.

Q: Wollongong provide more services, pools are free

A: It's a comparative rate, all councils provide different levels of services, we have more roads, we use a range of comparisons.

Q: Refer to sheet - change to the approach to litigation, its an increasing cost to Council, concern is over Hyams beach traffic controls and the cost to ratepayers as a whole

A: It is getting balanced, litigation is the one budget you can never predict

Note: Craig will come back to the CCB's on a % of litigation compared to other Councils

Q: Hyams community of 150 residents, increasing to 6500 in peak period, who is the target?

A: When dealing with 100,000 population and large tourism increase we sometimes need to be generic in how we approach resolving issues, and we sometimes have to be experimental

Q: Lake Tabourie: recurring capital cost, have to treat it like a business, has Council looked at the scene of getting an enterprise to do it?

A: Council sits on billions of \$ of assets. We have new staff coming in from the private sector coming in, \$6.5m of efficiencies over the last 5 years, SEC was funded through asset sales so we didn't have to borrow funds.

Council is obliged to provide a level of service, how Council minimises the loss and provides the community expensive assets to run like a cricket field.

Not like a full private company in that Council has to provide community/social type services.

Russ Pigg noted that it is proposed to hold 3 public SRV meetings.

7. Assets and Works Update

Tony Fraser provided a presentation and highlighted the Capital Works Program. The following points were made:

The Rate rise has been focused on road renewal and maintaining an acceptable level of service. There is a lot of work to do to bring roads up to standard.

- A snapshot of work completed in the last 6 months:
 - Beach Road, Berry
 - Greenwell Point Road (Stage 1)
 - Albatross Road
 - Callala Beach Road
 - Prince Edward Avenue (Stage 2)
 - Bendalong Road (Stage 1 in progress)

The Resealing / Resurfacing Program is a critical preventative maintenance activity. 2016/2017 Resealing program estimated at \$5.9m.

- John Purcell Way is an example of the works
 - Preparation of Works are in progress
 - Sealing to be done in the warmer months
- Kerbs and Pathways
 - Rate rise funding will also go towards kerb/gutter and footpath
 - Increased spend to replace failing kerbs
- A lot of asset improvement activities are going on:
 - Bolong Road, Bomaderry
 - Greys Beach Boat Ramp
 - Huskisson Town Centre refresh the street scape

-
- Stewart Place car park upgraded for bus interchange
 - Installing pedestrian access points in St Georges Basin, Tomerong, Matron Porter Drive and Pine Forest Road (on road footpath)
 - New amenities at Ison Park
 - Playground access in Mollymook
 - Major Projects in Progress:
 - Shoalhaven Indoor Sports Centre - \$13.6M
 - Jerrerra Estate Infrastructure - \$4.9M
 - Flinders Road roundabouts and heavy vehicle upgrade - \$6.75M
 - Lake Conjola Boardwalk - \$650,000
 - Renewal of Buildings and Maintenance
 - Refresh of Berry School of Arts
 - Council is refreshing buildings in a wide range of areas including re-painting, re-cladding, re-roofing and flooring
 - Waste Services
 - Resource Recover Park
 - Key elements to providing a processing facility and reusable material
 - Tendering phase for building of the processing plant will be on the side of the current West Nowra facility
 - A new animal shelter is underway along BTU Road
 - The new Transfer Station is being built, to improve safety
 - There will be an undercover area where customers can unload and then waste will be scooped up and taken to the waste area.
 - The focus is on waste minimisation – Council is running a series of sustainability workshop programs, all information is on the website and most are free to the public.
 - Bereavement services
 - New purpose built cremator building with two new cremators
 - Property Unit
 - Demolition of the old bakery building in Sussex Inlet to make the property more attractive for sale in November
 - Holiday Haven
 - Continues to go from strength to strength, increasing income
 - Improvements of facilities and cabins and ensuite suites etc

Q: Does Holiday Haven make any contribution to Road maintenance?

A: The funds go back into crown reserve and maintaining current facilities

Q: How can we get funds from Holiday Haven to go into roads considering the tourism and caravans entering the area contributing to the road maintenance

A: The Minister wouldn't agree and under Crown Lands Act, the funds go back into parks and reserves

Q: In Currarong the Holiday Haven makes a lot of money, it has water features and other facilities, we desperately need a footpath and road maintenance

A: In Lake Conjola we want money to be spent in the area its generated

A: Looking at the Crown Land area

Q: State Government funding for Moona Creek next year, are we able to move along the process?

A: It is going out as a design and construct, will be a progressive project

Q: When is the work at Verons estate going ahead?

A: It will be tendered out for construction purposes next year for tendering process, construction mid to late next year

Q: At the Currarong meeting last night, it was mentioned about the New Years Eve celebration, does council fund those? Currarong had one a few years ago and now they no longer wish too fund, can Council fund Currarong?

A: Council already supports the fireworks at Berry, Ulladulla, Nowra and Huskisson

- Council Property Strategy
 - Council manages approximately 2700 parcels
 - 450 Crown Land that Council is trustee of

8. Open Q and A Q and A to Group Directors

See table below

CCB	Group Director / Staff	Question	Staff Response
		<p>Topic: Holiday letting and Airbnb</p> <p>1. The CCB's held a discussion about raising concerns over Airbnb and the difficulties the local operators are faced with especially over the peak periods/</p> <p>2. This has become a high priority issue in Huskisson with over 1500 properties and only approximately 900 residents, and an increasing number of unregulated Airbnb John Willmott – in 2006 Shoalhaven Tourism had paid ads with Stayz. Council needs to get behind the local operators of hotels etc</p> <p>A bed tax was suggested.</p>	<p>1. Phil Costello - There is a call from the State Government for a submission till end of October, the concerns have been raised and several options have been put forward for regulation. Council encourages all local operators to put in a submission. Its not just in the Shoalhaven its state wide issue. We need to wait until legislation is implemented. Note that if you don't have onsite management a DA is required. Russ Pigg – Council is taking a firm position in relation to a development consent, we would require a consent for a holiday letting property only if it were creating an issue on amenity impacts to the neighbours.</p> <p>2. Russ Pigg – If there is a property of concern in the CCB areas then the planning staff need to know if a property is becoming an issue There were some properties some years ago holding marriage celebrations that became an issue and Council took measures to alleviate the problem</p>

CCB	Group Director / Staff	Question	Staff Response
		<p>3. Sussex inlet houses are next to holiday homes, there needs to be rules for residential areas</p> <p>4. John Willomott – Convey to Council and Councillors that Council take on board the view and concerns of the local CCBs and coastal areas</p> <p>5. Party houses happening next to residential houses</p>	<p>3. Craig Milburn – this is a compliance issue, motels are part of the mix as the tourism area</p> <p>4. Craig Milburn - It's a bigger issue than what Council can deal with. The ATO wants Council to talk about the properties in the area</p> <p>5. Russ Pigg – this is obviously a concern to hotels and other people in the area. The role of CCBs is to convey concerns of residents if they don't want to deal directly with Council</p>
Ulladulla Districts Community Forum and	GM/ Jessica Rippon Phil Costello	<p>There needs to be a clear, short set of rules for CCBs. These need to be the same for all CCBs in the Shoalhaven, so interaction with Council is the same rule for all.</p> <p>That meetings are held as determined by those in the CCB area.</p> <p>That meeting procedure be followed with Minutes taken. A copy of these Minutes be sent to all on the mailing list and to Council Included in the meeting agenda will be a financial report.</p> <p>A decision made at a CCB meeting to contact Council: This should state:</p> <p>* the decision made - motion passed</p>	<p>A: Council has had a similar experience with Hyams Beach in relation to DAs</p> <p>A: Council is working through an overarching engagement strategy and a set of rules.</p>

CCB	Group Director / Staff	Question	Staff Response
		<p>* the number who signed the attendance sheets * could give reasons for the decision</p> <p>I put "signed the attendance sheets" because sometimes, people come in late and forget to sign or even some committee members fail to sign because each is busy doing his or her task.</p> <p>My experience is that the number on the sheets is less than the actual attendance but the sheets give the validation.</p> <p>Some CCBs meet monthly, some less frequently. There are DAs or other matters that can arise after one meeting and before the next.</p> <p>A decision made to contact Council between CCB meetings, should list the number of committee members and state the number and the names of the committee members who agree with the detail being sent. If anyone else is co-opted to work on a submission or report, that name or names also be included.</p> <p>I don't say "sign" because decisions can be made by email or over the phone.</p> <p>It needs to be kept in mind that we are volunteers, working in our own time and using our own "office" facilities.</p>	<p>Q: When are you planning the new set of guidelines A: within the next month or so Q: Are there any CCB representatives on the working executive? Q: We all need the same rules if CCBs were to communicate with Council Q: CCB and Progress Associatopns are different and one follows rules and the other has its own opinion Q: Has Council considered stopping the CCB subsidy A: its only a suggestion Q: Many people of the community has been involved in the development of DCPs etc, we are seeing variations to DCPs etc, concern is there needs to be a benchmark A: Russ Pigg - Council has a delegation to allow some flexibility with some variations Phil Costello – DCPs are performance based they are not legislation, Council will adopt a DCP and recognise each development on merit, we are instructed under the act to do that, when we do grant variations, it is impossible to develop a policy on every single scenario. Q: The tree issue from endeavour energy A: Council is aware of the issue with other Councils, will take it on board and will raise it at the IPJO</p>

CCB	Group Director / Staff	Question	Staff Response
			<p>Jessica Rippon: We are going to do a session on CCB attendance, and rules people are interested in.</p> <p>Can have a steering group/workshop and work on those issues.</p> <p>We have ad some changes in team, Kate will move to new role and the CCB role will have new member of team</p> <p>We will set up a working party asap</p> <p>Thanked all CCBs for attending.</p> <p>3.20pm</p>
Sussex Inlet	Tony Fraser Craig Milburn	<p>would like to ask/know when the streetscape work is to commence as we have had no correspondence on this project for many months, and nor has the Chamber of Commerce.</p> <p>Another question being put by a number of community members is "When are the essential roadworks in Verons Estate to be begun and what is the time frame for completion of the total works for which the ratepayers there are already being charged?</p> <p>This has come up because some Verons Estate ratepayers are considering paying, in lump sum, that special rate variation upfront and need to sign and return the deed of agreement by the 19th October, 2017.The deed does not register a commitment by</p>	The CCB should write to Council.

CCB	Group Director / Staff	Question	Staff Response
		<p>Council to have the works done and no time frame within the 20 years for any works to be completed.</p> <p>This situation would seem to disadvantage some ratepayers as does the stipulation that if the funds are not committed to expenditure within 20 years, the monies are to be refunded to the rate payers, exclusive of interest which will be payable to Council's account.</p> <p>Has there been a Council resolution referring to when these works are to be done?</p> <p>The possible special rate variation or levy to be charged to ratepayers with properties on Council owned Canals and what is to be done about the many encroachments on that land and the foreshores is another rates matter that all the community wish to be aware of and informed about in a Public Meeting just as was Veron's Estate Special Rates Levy because anything done here has implications for all ratepayers.</p> <p>Has there been a Council resolution referring to when these works are to be done?</p> <p>Would council take over the canal and be in passible for boats</p>	

The meeting closed the time being 3.20pm.